

Modelling and analysis of crack turning on aeronautical structures

Modelling and analysis of crack turning on aeronautical structures



Doctoral Thesis

Llorenç Llopart Prieto

Director:

Dr. Marc Anglada i Gomila



Company director:

Elke Hombergsmeier



Llorenç Llopart Prieto



Ottoburnn / Barcelona April 2007

References

- [1] Munroe J., Wilkins K. and Gruber M. Integral Airframe Structures (IAS)-Validated Feasibility Study of Integrally Stiffened Metallic Fuselage Panels for Reducing Manufacturing Costs. NASA/CR-2000-209337. 2000.
- [2] Swift T. Damage tolerance in pressurized fuselages. 11th Plantema Memorial Lecture on the 14th Symposium of the ICAF. 1987.
- [3] Kosai M., Shiamoto A., Yu C. T., Walker S.I., Kobayashi A.S. and Tan P. Axial Crack propagation and arrest in pressurized fuselages. Structural integrity of aging airplanes A93-45772, pp. 225-239. 1991.
- [4] Kosai M., Kobayashi A. S. and Ramulu M. Tear straps in aircraft fuselage. Durability of metal aircraft structures: Proceedings of international workshop on structural integrity of aging airplanes, Atlanta technology publications, Atlanta, GA, pp. 443-457. 1992.
- [5] Swift T. Damage Tolerance analysis of redundant structures. Douglas Aircraft Company. 1978.
- [6] Chen C. S., Wawrzynek P. A. and Ingraffea A. R. Crack growth simulation and residual strength prediction in airplane fuselages. NASA/CR-1999-209115. 1999.
- [7] Pettit R.G. Crack Turning/Arrest Behavior of integral Structure. Cornell University. 1998.
- [8] Pettit R.G., Newman J.C. and Domack M.S. Crack turning damage tolerance approach for integrally stiffened structure. 19th ICAF Symposium. 1997.
- [9] Pettit R.G. Crack turning in integrally stiffened aircraft structures. NASA Langley Research Center. August 2000.

- [10] Badía Perez J. M. and Tarín Remohí P. Productos extruidos de aluminio en la industria aeronáutica: Presente y futuro. Dept. de Materiales y producción Aeroespacial, ETSIA, UPM. 2002.
- [11] Palm F. Moderne metallische Werkstoffe und Prozesse -eine Innovationsquelle in der Luft- und Raumfahrt und eine „olympische“ Herausforderung. Presentation. ILA Berlin 2004.
- [12] Warren R. and Wei L.-Y. Metallic alloys. MPM013 Luleå University-Division of Engineering Materials. 1997.
- [13] Nesterenko G. I. and Nesterenko B. Residual strength analysis of the stiffened structures with WFD, MSD and single crack. Aging Aircraft. 2002.
- [14] Richard H. A. Bruchmechanischer Festigkeitsnachweis bei Mixed-Mode-Beanspruchung von Rissen. 35. Tagung DVM Arbeitskreis Bruchvorgänge. Freiburg. ISSN 1616-4687. pp. 207-219. 2003.
- [15] Christ H. J., Schöler K., Fischer F., Maier H. J., Krupp U. and Fritzen C. F. Ermüdungsverhalten metallischer Werkstoffe. Werkstoff-Informations-gesellschaft. 1998.
- [16] Pook L. T. Crack Paths. WIT Press. 2002.
- [17] Inglis, C. E. Stresses in a plate due to presence of cracks and sharp corners. Transaction of the institute of naval architects, 55(1), pp. 219-241. 1913.
- [18] Westergaard, H. M. Bearing pressures and cracks. Journal of Applied Mechanics 6(2), pp. 49-53. 1939.
- [19] Sneddon N. The distribution of stress in the neighbourhood of a crack in an elastic solid. Proceedings of the Royal Society London. Ser. A, 187, pp. 229-250. 1946.

- [20] Irwin, G. R. Analysis of stresses and strains near the end of a crack traversing a plate. *Journal of Applied Mechanics* 24(3), 361-364. 1957.
- [21] Williams M.L. On the stress distribution at the base of a stationary crack. *ASME Applied Mechanics Division*. 56 A-16. 1956.
- [22] Richard H. A., Schöllmann M., Buchholz F. G. and Fulland M. Comparison of 3D fracture criteria. 35. Tagung DVM Arbeitskreis Bruchvorgänge. ISSN 1616-4687. pp. 335-347. 2003.
- [23] Pettit R. G., Wang J.J. and Toh C. Validated Feasibility Study of integrally Stiffened Metallic Fuselage Panels for Reducing Manufacturing Costs. NASA/CR-2000-209342. 2000.
- [24] Zaal Ir. K.J.J.M. Deflection of longitudinal cracks in the Airbus A320 fuselage. TU Delft. 1999.
- [25] Wang Y. Y. On the two-parameter characterization of Elastic-Plastic Crack-Front Fields in Surface-Cracked Plates. *Constraint Effects in Fracture*, ASTM STP 1171, pp. 120–138. 1993.
- [26] Pawliska P. Stabiles Risswachstum in duktilen Materialien bei kombinierter Normal- und Schubbeanspruchung. VDI Verlag GmbH. 1996.
- [27] Dalle Donne C. Übertragbarkeit von Risswiderstandskurven von Standardproben auf biaxial belastete, bauteilähnliche Kreuzproben. VDI Verlag GmbH. 1997.
- [28] Rice J. R. A path independent integral and the approximate analysis of strain concentration by notches and cracks. *Journal of Applied Mechanics* 35, pp. 379-386. 1968.
- [29] Wells, A. A. Unstable crack propagation in metals: Cleavage and fast fracture. *Proceedings of the crack propagation symposium*, 1, paper 84, Cranfield, UK. 1961.

- [30] Shih C. F. Relationship between the J -integral and the crack displacement for stationary and extending cracks. *Journal of the Mechanics and Physics of Solids* 29, pp. 305-326. 1981.
- [31] James M. A. A plane stress finite element model for elastic-plastic *Mode I/II* crack growth. Applied Computational Laboratory. 1998.
- [32] Halbäck N., Jönsson N. T -stress evaluations of mixed mode I/II fracture specimens and T -effects on mixed mode failure of aluminium. *International Journal of Fracture* 76, pp. 141-168. 1996.
- [33] Wang Y. Y. and Parks D. M. Evaluation of the elastic T -stress in surface-cracked plates using the line-spring method. *International Journal of Fracture* 56, pp. 25-40. 1992.
- [34] Zerbst U. and Schödel M. Analytische Simulation von Stabilem Rissfortschritt in dünnwandigen Strukturen mit der Europäischen Fehlerbewertungsprozedur SINTAP. Deutscher Verband für Materialforschung und -Prüfung E.V. 2003.
- [35] Gao H. Variation of elastic T -stress along slightly wavy 3D crack fronts. *International Journal of Fracture* 58, pp. 241-257. 1991.
- [36] Dalle Donne C. The crack tip displacement vector; approach to mixed-mode fracture. American Society for testing and materials, pp. 21-40. 1999.
- [37] Sham T. L. The determination of the elastic T -term using higher order weight functions. *International Journal of Fracture* 41, pp. 81-102. 1991.
- [38] Larsson S. G. and Carlsson A. J. Influence of non-singular stress terms and specimen geometry on small-scale yielding at crack tip in elastic-plastic materials. *Journal of the Mechanics and Physics of Solids* 21, pp. 263-277. 1973.
- [39] Shin Dong K. and Ju Lee J. Numerical analysis of dynamic T -Stress of moving interfacial crack. *Int. Jour. Fracture*, pp. 1-23. 2002.

- [40] Dalle Donne C. Skalierung von δ_5 -Rißwiderstandskurven mit der T -Spannung. Deutscher Verband für Materialforschung und -Prüfung E.V. pp. 151-162. 2003.
- [41] Betegón C. and Hancock J. W. Two-parameter characterisation of elastic-plastic crack tip fields. Transactions of the ASME Journal of Applied Mechanics 58, pp. 104-110. 1991.
- [42] Hällback N. and Jönsson N. T -stress evaluations of mixed mode I/II fracture specimens and T -effects on mixed mode failure of aluminium.
- [43] Kim Yun-Jae, Chung Ki-Hyun, Kim Jin-Su and Kim Young-Jin. Effect of biaxial loads on elastic-plastic J -integral and crack tip constraint for cracked plates: finite element study. International Journal of Fracture 44, vol. 130, pp. 803-825. 2004
- [44] Paris, P. C. and Erdogan, F. A. critical analysis of crack propagation laws. Journal of Basic Engineering 91D(4), pp. 746-769. 1963.
- [45] Forman, R. G. Kearney V. E. and Engle R. M. Numerical analysis in cyclic-loaded structures. Journal of Basic Engineering Transaction of the ASME 89, pp. 459-464. 1967.
- [46] Ingraffea A. R., Carter B. J. and Wawrzynek P. A. FRANC3D concepts and user guides, version 2.6. The Cornell Fracture Group, 2003.
- [47] Apicella A., Citarella R., Esposito R. and Soprano A. Some SIF 's evaluations by Dual BEM for 3D cracked plates. Achievements in Mechanical & Materials Engineering. 1999.
- [48] Apicella A., Citarella R. and Soprano A. 3D Stress Intensity Factor evaluation by Dual BEM . BEASY Technical Papers in the context of BRITE-EURAM (SMAAC) project.
- [49] Chen C., Krause R., Pettit R., Banks-Sills L. and Ingraffea A.R. Numerical assessment of T -Stress computation using a p-version finite element method. International Journal of Fracture 107, pp. 177-199. 2001.
- [50] StressCheck Manuals. ESRD Inc. 2001.

- [51] ANSYS Manuals. ANSYS Inc. 2003.
- [52] Duster A. and Rank E. The p-version of the finite element method compared to an adaptive h-version for the deformation theory of plasticity. *Comput. Methods Appl. Mech. Engrg.* 190. 2001, pp. 1925-1935.
- [53] Burkhardt M. Ein Beitrag zur praxisnahen Simulation der Ausbreitung von Ermüdungsrissen bei komplexer Beanspruchung. VDI Verlag GmbH. 1998.
- [54] Dhondt G. 3D Mixed-mode K -calculations with the interaction integral method and the quarter point element stress method. *Commun. Numeric methods engineering*, 17, pp. 303-307. 2001.
- [55] Leevers P. S. and Radon J. C. Inherent stress biaxiality in various fracture specimen geometries. *International Journal of Fracture* 19, pp. 311-325. 1982.
- [56] Kfoury A. P. Some evaluations of the elastic T -term using Eshelby's method. *International Journal of Fracture* 30, pp. 301-315. 1986.
- [57] Dhondt G. Mixed-Mode Berechnung mit ABAQUS. DVM report. 2000.
- [58] Sherry A. H., France C. C. and Goldthorpe M. R. Compendium of T -stress solutions for two and three dimensional cracked geometries. *Fatigue and Fracture engineering materials and structures*, 18(1), pp. 141-155. 1995.
- [59] Chao Y. J. and S. Liu. On the failure of cracks under mixed-mode loads. *International Journal of Fracture* 87, pp. 201-223. 1997.
- [60] Ritchie R. D., Smith R. F. and Knott, J. F. Effect of thickness on fibrous fracture from a notch and fatigue crack propagation in low-strength steels. *Metal Science*, 9(11), pp. 485-492. 1975.

- [61] Cheung S. and Lusmore A. R. A shear lip analysis of concave R -curves for an $AlMgZn$ alloy. *International Journal of Fracture* 117(3), pp. 195-205. October 2002.
- [62] Erdogan F. and Sih G. C. On the crack Extension in Plates under Plane Loading and Transverse shear. *Journal of Basic Engineering*, pp. 519-527. December 1963.
- [63] Cotterell B. and Rice J. R. Slightly curved or kinked cracks. *International Journal of Fracture* 16(2), pp. 155-169. 1980.
- [64] Sumi Y., Nemat-Nasser S. and Keer L. M. On crack path stability in a finite body. *Engineering fracture mechanics* 22(5), pp. 759-771. 1985.
- [65] Williams J. G. and Ewing P. D. Fracture under complex stress-The angled crack problem. *International Journal of Fracture Mechanics* 8, pp. 441-446. 1972.
- [66] Finnie I. and Saith A. A note on the angled crack problem and the directional stability of cracks. *International Journal of Fracture* 9, pp. 484-486. 1973.
- [67] Dugdale D. S. Yielding in steel sheets containing slits. *Journal of the Mechanics and Physics of Solids* 8, pp. 100-104. 1960.
- [68] Rice J. and Johnson M. A. *Inelastic behaviour of solids*. McGraw Hill, New York, pp. 641-690. 1969.
- [69] Streit R. and Finnie I. An experimental investigation of crack path directional stability. *Experimental Mechanics*, 20, pp. 17-23. 1980.
- [70] McMeeking R. M. and Parks D. M. On criteria of J -dominance of crack-tip fields in large-scale yielding. *ASTM* 668, pp. 175-194. 1979.
- [71] Buczeck M. B. and Herakovich C. T. A normal stress criterion for crack extension direction in orthotropic composite materials. *Journal of Composite Materials* 19, pp. 544-553. 1985.

- [72] Boone T. J., Wawrzynek P. A. and Ingraffea A. R. Finite element modelling of fracture propagation in orthotropic materials. *Engineering fracture mechanics*, 26(2), pp. 185-201. 1987.
- [73] Sih G. C. Strain Energy density factor applied to mixed mode crack problems. *International Journal of Fracture* 10, pp. 305-321. 1974.
- [74] Jiang Y. A fatigue criterion for general multiaxial loading. *Fatigue and fracture of engineering materials and structures*, 23, pp. 19-32. 1999.
- [75] Maiti S. K. and Smith R. A. Comparison of the criteria for mixed mode brittle fracture based on the preinstability stress-strain field. Part I: Slit and elliptical cracks under uniaxial tensile loading. *International Journal of Fracture* 23(4), pp. 281-295. 1983.
- [76] Griffith A. A. The phenomenon of flow and rupture in solids. *Phil. Transaction Royal Society A*. 221, pp. 163-198. 1920.
- [77] Bergner F., Zouhar G. and Tempus G. The material-dependent variability of fatigue crack growth rates of aluminum alloys in the Paris regime. *International Journal of Fatigue* 23, pp. 383-394. 2001.
- [78] Schijve J. Fatigue crack propagation in light alloy sheet material and structures. *Advances in Aeronautical Sciences*, pp. 387-408. 1962.
- [79] Shiamoto A., Kosai M. and Kobayashi A.S. Crack arrest at tear strap under mixed mode loading. *Engineering Fracture Mechanics*, vol. 47, pp. 59-74. 1994.
- [80] Zaal K. J. J. M. A survey of crack path stability criteria and their application to crack flapping phenomena in stiffened structures. TU Delft. 1992.
- [81] Findlay S. and Harrison N. D. Why aircraft fail? *Materials today*. Nov. 2002.
- [82] Shimamoto A., Kosai M. and Kobayashi A. S. Crack arrest at tear strap under mixed mode loading. *Engineering fracture mechanics*, 47, pp. 59-74. 1994.

- [83] Llopart Ll., Kurz B., Wellhausen C., Anglada M., Drechsler K. and Wolf K. Investigation of fatigue crack growth and crack turning on integral stiffened structures under *Mode I* loading. *Engineering fracture mechanics*, 73, pp. 2139-2152. 2006.
- [84] Potyondy D. O. Discrete crack growth analysis methodology for cracks in pressurized fuselage structures. *FAA/NASA Symposium on advanced structural integrity methods for airframe durability and damage tolerance*. NASA conference publication 3274(2), pp. 581-601. 1994.
- [85] Knops B. Numerical simulation of crack growth in pressurized fuselages. Ph.D. Thesis at Delft University of technology. September 1994.
- [86] Theilig H., Wünsch M. and Zipser H. Ein neues Konzept zur effizienten Berechnung von Spannungsintensitätsfaktoren bei Mixed-Mode Problemen mit der modifizierten virtuellen Riss-schließungsmethode. 35. Tagung DVM Arbeitskreis Bruchvorgänge, Freiburg. 2003.
- [87] Dhondt G. Computational fracture analysis of different specimens regarding 3D and mode coupling effects. *Engineering fracture mechanics*, 68, pp. 383-401. 2000.
- [88] Mostovoy S., Crosley P. B. and Ripling E. J. Use of crack-line-loaded specimens for measuring plane strain fracture toughness. *Journal of Materials* 2(3), pp. 661-681. 1967.
- [89] Assler H. Investigation of crack turning phenomena to improve the damage tolerance behaviour of integral airframe structures. *Proceedings of the seventh international conference on biaxial/multiaxial fatigue and fracture*. pp. 459-464. Berlin 2004.
- [90] Dhondt G. Mixed-mode *K*-Faktorenberechnung in anisotropen Elastischen Materialien. DVM report. 2001.
- [91] Buchholz F. G., Just V. and Richard H. A. Computergestützte Simulation und Experimentelle Ergebnisse zur 3D-Rissausbreitung in einer 3PB-Probe mit geneigter Rissebene. 35. Tagung DVM Arbeitskreis Bruchvorgänge, Freiburg. 2003.

- [92] Kalluri S. and Bonacuse P. J. *Multiaxial fatigue and deformation: Testing and prediction*. ASTM STP 1387. ISBN 0-803-2865-7. 2000
- [93] Miller K. J. and McDowell D. L. *Mixed-mode crack behaviour*. ASTM STP 1359. ISBN 0-8031-2602-6. 1999.
- [94] *FRANC3D Menu & Dialog Reference*. Version 2.6. Cornell Fracture Group. 2003.
- [95] *FRANC2D & OSM 3D Tutorial*. Version 2.6. Cornell Fracture Group. 2003.
- [96] Engineering Software Research and Development, Inc. *StressCheck® Modeling Guide*. Release 6.1. November 2001.
- [97] Fett T. *T-stresses for internally cracked components*. FZKA 6026. 1997.
- [98] Sladek J. and V. Evaluation of the *T*-stress for interface cracks by the boundary element method. *Engineering fracture mechanics* 56(6), pp. 813-825. 1997.
- [99] Actis R. L. Modification of StressCheck to provide an extraction procedure to compute the *T*-stress for 2D and 3D crack problems. *ESRD*, Inc. November 2003.
- [100] B. Gross and Srawley J. E. *Stress Intensity Factors for Single-Edge Notch Specimens Subjected to Splitting Forces*. NASA TN D-3295. 1966.
- [101] Fichter, W. B. The stress intensity factor for the double cantilever beam. *International Journal of Fracture* 22, pp. 133-143. 1983.
- [102] Noble B. *Methods based on the Wiener-Hopf Technique for the solution of partial differential equations*. Pergammon Press 1958.
- [103] Foote R. M. L. and Buchwald V. T. An exact solution for the stress intensity factor for a double cantilever beam. *International Journal of Fracture* 29, pp. 125-134. 1985.

- [104] Pook L. P. Comments on fatigue crack growth under mixed mode I and III and pure mode III loading. Eds. Miller K. J. and Brown M. W. *Multiaxial Fatigues*, ASTM STP853, American Society for Testing and Materials. Philadelphia, pp. 249-263. 1985
- [105] Pook L. P. *Linear elastic fracture Mechanics for engineers: theory and application*. WIT press, Southampton. 2000.
- [106] Cotterell B., On fracture path stability in the compact tension test. *International Journal of Fracture Mechnics*, 6(2), pp. 189-182, 1970.
- [107] Pook L. P. and Holmes R. Biaxial fatigue test. *Proc. of the Fatigue Testing and Design Conf., Society of environmental engineers fatigue group: Buntingford, Herts 2*, pp. 36.1-36.33. 1976.
- [108] Broberg K. B. *Cracks and Fracture*. Academic Press: San Diego, CA, 1999.
- [109] Melin, S. Why do cracks avoid each other? *International Journal of Fracture*, 23(1), pp. 37-45. 1983.
- [110] Hallbäck N. and Jönsson N. *T*-stress evaluations of mixed mode I/II fracture specimens and *T*-effects on mixed mode failure of aluminium. *International Journal of Fracture* 76, pp. 141-168. 1996.
- [111] Ramulu M. and Kobayashi A. S. Dynamic crack curving- A Photoelastic Evaluation. *Experimental Mechanics*. 1982.
- [112] Dalle Donne C. and Döker H. Plane Stress Crack resistance curves of an inclined crack under biaxial loading. American Society for testing and materials, pp.243-263. 1997.

Standards

- [S1] Airbus Industrie. Aerospatiale. 7075-T6 Aluminium alloy sheets. Standards Manual. Normalisation Generale. ASN-A3129 Issue E, 1992.

- [S2] British Aerospace Airbus. Aluminium Alloy 2024-T3 sheet. Metallic Material specification. ABM 1-6015 Issue 1.
- [S3] ASTM E399. Standard test methods for plane strain fracture toughness of metallic material. Annual book of ASTM standards 3. 2001.
- [S4] Airbus material specification. Aluminium alloy (6013/6156). AIMS_03-04-040. 2004.
- [S5] ASTM E647. Standard test methods for measurement of fatigue crack growth rates. Annual book of ASTM standards. Section 3. Metals test and analytical procedures 1, pp. 565-601. 1996
- [S6] DIN EN 10002-1; Metallische Werkstoffe-Zugversuch-Teil 1: Prüfverfahren bei Raumtemperatur. Ausgabe 2001-12.
- [S7] Airbus Industrie Test Method. Determination of fatigue crack growth rates for aluminium clad sheet and clad plate up to 12 mm in constant-load-amplitude tests-*K*-increasing Method. AITM 1-0042. June 2001.
- [S8] Office of aviation research. Metallic materials properties development and standardization (*MMPDS*). Office of aviation research. DOT7FAA/AR-MMPDS-01. 2003.
- [S9] MIL-H-13528 Hydrochloric acid, inhibited, rust-removing. February 1982.

Internet Web sites

- [W1] <http://afgrow.wpafb.af.mil/>
- [W2] <http://www.swri.edu/> under SwRI software.
- [W3] <http://www.ansys.com/>
- [W4] <http://www.cfg.cornell.edu/> under software

[W5] <http://www.eads.net/> under *EADS/Corporate Research Center and Marketplace*

[W6] <http://www.esrd.com/>

[W7] <http://www.samcef.com/> under software

[W8] <http://www.abaqus.com/>

[W9] <http://www.beasy.com/>

