

DOCTORAL THESIS

Title ALLIANCE PORTFOLIOS AND VALUE CREATION:

THEORY AND EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE FROM THE

GLOBAL AIRLINE INDUSTRY

Presented by ULRICH WASSMER

Centre ESADE – ESCUELA SUPERIOR DE

ADMINISTRACIÓN Y DIRECCIÓN DE EMPRESAS.

Department BUSINESS POLICY, HUMAN RESOURCES AND

INFORMATION SYSTEM

Directed by DR. PIERRE DUSSAUGE

DR. MARCEL PLANELLAS

DEDICATION

Für Cristina und Fabio.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

During the past four and a half years as a doctoral student, I have had the opportunity to tap into the knowledge and experience of a great number of individuals who all contributed to this dissertation and my professional development as a management scholar in one way or another. Now is the time to thank each of them.

First and most important, I would like to express my deep respect and gratitude to my two advisors: Pierre Dussauge of the HEC School of Management Paris and Marcel Planellas of ESADE for their support and guidance. Pierre, although in a different location, has always been available when I needed his help and input. He did not only teach me everything I know about researching strategic alliances but also constantly challenged my ideas. Marcel served as my process supervisor, making sure I was going to finish in time, but more importantly as an important sounding board for the many questions I had on entering the academic life. Thank you Pierre and Marcel!

Furthermore, my gratitude goes to a number of people at ESADE who all contributed in one way or another to the completion of this dissertation. Eduard Bonet for making sure I understand the philosophical dimensions of conducting research early on. Carmen Ansotegui, Joan-Manuel Batista, Josep Bisbe, Pedro Parada, and Silviya Svejenova who provided helpful comments on my work at different stages. Montse Ollé for financial support and giving me the opportunity to develop my teaching skills in various ESADE programs. Pilar Gallego and Maria-Angels Auge for outstanding administrative support. My peers in ESADE's Ph.D. program for many inspiring discussions: Camilo Cataldo, Jan Hohberger, Laura Guillen, and Sofia Kusyk.

Moreover, I thank everyone at the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania who provided feedback on my research and made my one-year stay there an outstanding experience. I would like to thank Roz Cohen, Ian C. MacMillan, Harbir Singh, Luzi Hail, and Katherine Klein, as well as the participants of the Wharton Ph.D. Research Seminar and the Snider Entrepreneurial Research Center Research Seminar. In particular I would like to thank the following Wharton doctoral students who were always available to listen to my ideas and provide valuable feedback and comments: Rocio Bonet, Aseem Kaul, and Brian Wu. Moreover, I would like to thank the staff of the Wharton Lippincott Library who provided outstanding help and support in my data collection effort.

I am also indebted to all those scholars who provided advice, observations, and critical comments during various doctoral consortia, conferences, and other formal or informal encounters: Paul Almeida, Bernard Garrette, Ming-Cher Chen, Will Mitchell, Dovev Lavie, Margie Peteraf, Jeff Reuer, Pablo Sanchez Lorda, Leslie Schaefer, Marco Tortoriello, and Werner Hoffmann. I also value the feedback by the participants of the research seminars at the College of Business Administration of Northeastern University (Boston, USA); Faculty of Economics and Management at the Universidade Nova de Lisboa (Portugal); the Rotterdam School of Management at Erasmus University (Netherlands); and the John Molson School of Business of Concordia University (Montreal, Canada).

My thanks also go to Atilio Costaguta of the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) in Montreal for granting me access to ICAO data. I also thank the following alliance managers for making interview time available and teaching me how

alliances in the airline industry work: Patrick Bianquis (Air France), Bliss Blodget Stephan (American Airlines), Jörg Hennemann (Deutsche Lufthansa AG), Anna Marzella (Air Canada), and John Woodin (Delta Air Lines). Moreover, I thank Gerben Broekema of the Travel and Logistics practice of McKinsey & Company for his willingness to answer all of my questions and provide valuable insights.

When it was time to think about how to turn my research into a job, I was extremely fortunate to have had the support of two excellent coaches: Francisco Polidoro, Jr. of the McCombs School of Business at the University of Texas at Austin and Claus Rerup of the Ivey School of Business at the University of Western Ontario. Thank you so much guys for your continuous support and sharing your invaluable experience with me!

I also gratefully acknowledge the financial support during three years provided by the Agencia de Gestio d'Ajuts Universitaris i de Recerca of the Generalitat de Catalunya and the Fundación Caja Madrid for enabling me to spend my forth year at Wharton.

Last but not least, I want to express my gratitude to my family for their constant support and patience. Above all, my wife Cristina who often wondered why I gave up a "real job" to pursue this academic endeavor and Fabio who did not see me as much as he should have during his first 10 months. My mother Annemarie Wassmer and the Bellodi family for providing the family support system that we needed when we were between Barcelona and Philadelphia.

ABSTRACT

Alliance Portfolios and Value Creation: Theory and Empirical Evidence from the Global Airline Industry

Ulrich Wassmer

Do alliance portfolios matter? How do resources accessed from multiple simultaneous strategic alliances with different partners affect value creation and value appropriation? Do alliance portfolios explain heterogeneity across firms with respect to the value that they derive from entering into new strategic alliances? This dissertation builds on insights from the resource-based view of the firm and the strategic behavior and competitive dynamics literature and advances a theoretical model that addresses value creation and appropriation in firms that access resources through multiple simultaneous interfirm alliances with different partners. The model illustrates that value creation on the alliance portfolio level is a function of the value created from synergistic resource combinations involving resources accessed from different partners as well the value destroyed by incompatibilities between a focal firm's resource combinations and those deployed by its partners. Based on this theoretical model, empirically testable hypotheses are developed in a marginal setting, in which a multilaterally connected firm adds one new strategic alliance to its alliance portfolio. The hypotheses are tested using an event study method approach and data from the global airline industry on codeshare agreements formed between 1994 and 1998. The results show that the market on one side rewards firms entering into strategic alliances with partners that possess complementary resources and that contribute resources that cannot only be combined with firms' own but also existing relational resources and that are compatible with the firms' alliance portfolios. On the other side, results show that the market penalizes firms entering into alliances that contribute resources that are alliance portfolio incompatible in the sense that they create a competitive conflict with some of the existing alliance partners. The findings of the empirical part of this dissertation support the view that alliance portfolios affect the performance of firms entering into strategic alliances. This study concludes that resources accessed through interfirm alliances should not only be evaluated on their standalone and dyadic attributes but also in the context of alliance portfolios.

KEYWORDS

Strategic alliances, alliance portfolios, interconnected firm, resource-based view of the firm, strategic behavior, value creation, value appropriation, resource complementarity, resource incompatibility, firm performance, event study method, airline industry